PETER E. LORENZ

Fuller Theological Seminary

Justin Martyr as an Early "Western" Witness to the Synoptic Gospels

Abstract: The "Western" character of Justin's synoptic gospel sources is often taken for granted in discussions of the second-century text, due to Hort's influence (1882) and the work of Sanday (1876), Bousset (1891), Massaux (1952), and others. Yet a number of Justin's texts that passed for "Western" citations in the older literature would be excluded by more recent criteria, e.g., as published in SBL's *The New Testament in the Greek Fathers* series. This suggests that a critical reevaluation of Justin's relationship to the "Western" text is overdue. Based on my research into Justin's corpus of about 300 synoptic gospel citations, I will examine a pattern that may undermine the claim that Justin used a "Western" text, focusing on three texts that are frequently cited as evidence of "Western" readings: Luke 10:16, Mark 10:18, and Matthew 25:41.

Apology 16.10; 63.5 – Luke 10:16 or Matthew 7:24?

Matthew 10:40 – ο εμε δεχομενος δεχεται τον αποστειλαντα με
Matthew 7:24 - οστις ακουει μου τους λογους τουτους και ποιει αυτους ομοιωθησεται ανδρι φρονιμω

Justin		Luke 10:16		
Apology 16.10	*Apology* 63.5	D	Greek Mainstream	Θ (f^{13})
		ο ακουων ϋμων	ο ακουων υμων	ο ακουων ϋμων
		εμου ακουει και	εμου ακουει και	εμου ακουει και
		ο αθετων ϋμας εμε αθετει	ο αθετων υμας εμε αθετει	ο αθετων ϋμας εμε αθετει
ος γαρ ακουει μου και ποιει α λεγω	ο εμου ακουων	ο δε εμου ακουων	ο δε εμε αθετων	ο δε εμε αθετων
ακουει	ακουει	ακουει	αθετει	αθετει
του αποστειλαντος με	του αποστειλαντος με	του αποστειλαντος με	τον αποστειλαντα με	τον αποστηλαντα με
				και ο εμου ακουων ακουει
				του αποστιλαντος με

Despite its five-word span in NA^{28}, the variant results from the change of verb to ακουω, which necessitates the case change.

LATIN AND SYRIAC APPARATUS: *qui autem* (- i) *me audit audit eum qui me misit* d i r^1 ¦ *qui autem me spernit spernit eum qui me misit* vg = ܘܡܢ ܕܠܐ ܩܒܠ ܠܝ ܩܒܠ ܠܗ sy^{p} ¦ ܘܡܢ ܕܠܐ ܩܒܠ ܠܝ ܩܒܠ ܠܗ ܘܡܢ ܕܠܐ ܩܒܠ ܠܝ ܩܒܠ ܠܐܒܘܗܝ sy$^{(s)\,c}$ ¦ *et eum qui me misit* e | *et eum qui me misit qui autem me audit audit eum qui me misit* a b ¦ *lac.* ff^2.

Apology 16.7 – Mark 10:17-18 or Luke 18:18-19?

Synoptic parallels: Mark 10:17-18 = Luke 18:18-19 = Matthew 19:16-17. διδασκαλε + αγαθε, in Mark and Luke, but not Matthew. ουδεις αγαθος ει μη εις ο θεος, in Mark and Luke, but not Matthew.

Apology 16.7	*Pan.* 33.7.5	Mark 10:17-18	Mark 10:17-18	Luke 18:18-19
Justin	Ptolemy^{Epiph}	D	Greek Mainstream	Greek Mainstream
προσελθοντος αυτω		προσδραμων	προσδραμων	
τινος και ειποντος·		εις…ηρωτα αυτον λεγων	εις…επηρωτα αυτον	επηρωτησεν τις αυτον …
διδασκαλε αγαθε,		διδασκαλε αγαθε …	διδασκαλε αγαθε …	διδασκαλε αγαθε …
απεκρινατο λεγων		ο δε ις ειπεν αυτω …	ο δε ιησους ειπεν αυτω …	ειπεν δε αυτω ο ιησους …
ουδεις αγαθος	(ειναι αγαθον)	ουδεις αγαθος	ουδεις αγαθος	ουδεις αγαθος
ει μη μονος ο θεος ο ποιησας τα παντα	ενα γαρ μονον θεον τον εαυτου πατερα	ει μη μονος εις θεος	ει μη εις ο θεος	ει μη εις ο θεος

( ) Presented out of order.

MARK: *μονος εις* D / *solus unus* d; *unus* (*ac* b) *solus* b ff^2 ¦ *εις* ℵ A B C Θ $f^{1\,13}$ NA^{26-28} TR / *unus* (*est bonus* Ir) a k r^1 vg / ארמ sy$^{s\,p}$ ¦ *solus* c ¦ *lac.* e i sy^{c}.

LUKE: *εις* ℵ A B D Θ $f^{1\,13}$ NA^{26-28} TR / *unus* a b d e i r^1 / ארמ sy$^{s\,c\,p}$ ¦ *solus* aur c ff^2 vg ¦ *lac.* C.

SELECT WRITERS: ενα γαρ μονον ειναι αγαθον θεον τον εαυτου πατερα Ptol-G in Epiph *Pan.* 33.7.5; Ir *Haer.* 1.20.2 *quid me dicis bonum unus est bonus pater in caelis*; Clem-A, cited from Verheyden (2002): *Strom.* 2.114.3 εις δε εστιν αγαθος (attrib. Valentinus); 2.114.6 επειδαν δε επισκεψηται αυτην [καρδιαν] ο μονος αγαθος πατηρ (attrib. Valentinus); 7.58.5 ενα δε ειναι τον θεον ... ον μονον οντα θεον πατερα αγαθον.

Ptolemy: ενα γαρ μονον ειναι αγαθον θεον

(4) …this is the demiurge and maker of this entire world and everything in it. As he differs in essence from the other two <and> stands between them, he may rightly be awarded the title of "Intermediate." (5) And if, in his own nature, the perfect God is good—he is indeed, for our Savior has declared that his Father, whom he made manifest, is the **one** and **only** good God. And if a god of the adversary's nature is evil, and characterized as wicked by his injustice – then a God who stands between them, and is *neither good* nor, certainly, evil or unjust, may properly be called "just," and is the arbiter of his sort of justice. (*Pan*. 33.7.4-5; trans. Williams 1987, 203)

Justin: ουδεις αγαθος ει μη μονος ο θεος

16.6. And that one must worship God **alone** he entreated in these words: 'The greatest commandment is: "you shall worship the Lord your God, and him **alone**— the Lord God who made you—shall you serve with all your heart and all your strength." 16.7. And when someone approached him and said, 'Good teacher,' he replied: 'No one is good except God **alone**, who made all things.' 16.8. And whoever are not found living as he taught are not to be recognized as Christians, even if they speak the teachings of Christ with their tongues. For he said that not those who **only** speak but those who also do the works will be saved. (*1 Apol.* 16.6-8; trans. Minns and Parvis 2009, 119)

Variants in the Synoptic Citations of Ptolemaeus Gnosticus

NT Reference	Reference	Apparatus
Mt 5,39	*Pan. 33.6.3*	ραπιση] D L Δ Θ Π ל f1 22 1582 f13 543 28 157 565 892 BYZ ¦ ραπιζει א B W Σ 21 33 348 399 477 700 1279 1424 1473 1579 lct48
Mk 3,25-26	*Pan. 33.3.5*	δυναται] D BYZ ¦ δυνησεται B | σταθηναι] D BYZ ¦ στηναι B
Mt 15,8	*Pan. 33.4.13*	απεχει] B BYZ Justin (Dial. 78.11) rell. ¦ εστιν D 1424 it. vg. similiter sy omn. cf. Clem.
Mt 19,6; Mk 10,9	*Pan. 33.9.9*	συνεζευξεν] + εις εν D a d e* ff1 ff2 h r1
Mt 19,6; Mk 10,9	*Pan. 33.9.9*	χωριζετω] αποχωριζετω D
Mt 19,8	*Pan. 33.4.4*	μωυσης] B BYZ ¦ pon. post υμιν D a b c d e f g1 h r1 vg (1 MS)
Mt 19,8	*Pan. 33.4.4*	ου γεγονεν] B BYZ ¦ ουκ εγενετο D 46
Lk 12,46	*Pan. 33.11.8*	θησει] B BYZ ¦ pon. ante μετα D d gat Gg(II.III) HI

Dialogue 76.5 – Matthew 25:41

No synoptic parallels – εις το σκοτος το εξωτερον, cf. Matt 8:12; 22:13; 25:30; πατηρ with ετοιμαζω, cf. Matt 20:23; 22:4; 25:34.

Justin's *Dial.* 76.5 Text Justin	*Hom.* 19.2.5 Ps.-Clementine	Matthew 25:41, 30 D f^1	Matthew 25:41,30 Bא (Greek Mainstream)
Matt 25:41 και εν αλλοις λογοις		τοτε ερ(ε)ι και	τοτε ερει και
οις καταδικαζειν		τοις εξ ευωνυμων	τοις εξ ευωνυμων
τους αναξιους	([lacking])	(οι κατηραμενοι)	(κατηραμενοι)
μη σωζεσθαι μελλει			
εφη ερειν			
υπαγετε	υπαγετε	πορευεσθαι απ εμου	πορευεσθε απ εμου
Matt 25:30 εις το σκοτος το εξωτερον	εις το σκοτος το εξωτερον	εις το πυρ το αιωνιον	εις το πυρ το αιωνιον
Matt 25:41 ο ητοιμασεν ο πατηρ	ο ητοιμασεν ο πατηρ	ο ητοιμασεν ο πατηρ μου	το ητοιμασμενον
τω σατανα	τω διαβολω	τω διαβολω	τω διαβολω
και τοις αγγελοις αυτου	και τοις αγγελοις αυτου	και τοις αγγελοις αυτου	και τοις αγγελοις αυτου

( ) Presented out of order.

APPARATUS: *ο ητοιμασεν ο πατηρ* Ps-Cl *Hom.*19.2.5 / *quem praeparauit Pater* Ir *Haer.* 2.7.3; + *μου* D f^1 / *quem* (*quod* a d) (*prae-* d r) *paravit pater meus* a b c d ff^2 g^1 h r^1 Ir *Haer.* 3.23.3; 4.33.11; 4.40.2 ¦ *το ητοιμασμενον* **א** A B Θ f^{13} NA^{28} TR / *qui praeparatus est* vg / ܕܐܬܛܝܒ sy^s ܕܐܬܚܠܛ sy^p ¦ *lac.* C e k sy^c.

SELECT WRITERS: υπαγετε εις το σκοτος το εξωτερον ο ητοιμασεν ο πατηρ τω διαβολω και τοις αγγελοις αυτου Ps.-Clem. *Hom.*19.2.5; *et ignis autem aeternus, quem praeparauit Pater diabolo et angelis eius* Ir. *Haer.* 2.7.3 ; *abite, maledicti, in ignem aeternum, quem praeparauit Pater meus diabolo et angelis eiu* Irenaeus *Haer.* 3.23.3; *Abite a me, maledicti, in ignem aeternum quem praeparavit Pater meus diabolo et angelis ejus* Irenaeus *Haer.* 4.33.11; *Discedite a me, maledicti, in ignem aeternum quem praeparavit Pater meus diabolo et angelis ejus* Irenaeus *Haer.* 4.40.2; {πορευεσθε H | υπαγετε ER} απ εμου οι κατηραμενοι εις το πυρ το αιωνιον {ο ητοιμασεν ο πατηρ μου H | το ητοιμασμενον ER} τω διαβολω και τοις αγγελοις αυτου {ο ητοιμασεν ο πατηρ μου ER} Hippolytus *Antichr.* 65.3; και το πυρ δε προσκοπειτε ο ητοιμασεν ο κυριος τω διαβολω και τοις αγγελοις αυτου Clement *Protr.* 83.2; *discedite a me, maledicti, in ignem aeternum, quem praeparavit pater meus diabolo et angelis eius* Origen *Comm. Matt.* 68.